



## **AWARDS TO CONSULTANTS WORKING IN TRUSTS IN SPECIAL MEASURES**

### **Introduction**

1. As part of the quality assurance process for new awards and renewals, ACCEA asks the Care Quality Commission (CQC) to confirm Trusts in special measures and then review the names of those consultants currently working at those Trusts that are due to secure an award in 2017.

### **CQC position**

2. The consultants listed at Annex A have secured a new award or renewed an existing award in 2017 and work at a Trust in special measures.
3. The CQC's Chief Inspector of Hospitals, Professor Ted Baker, has stated that he is concerned about awarding clinical excellence awards (CEAs) to Trusts that are in special measures as it may send the wrong message. He recommends that awards are only made to consultants in those Trusts in exceptional circumstances.
4. This represents a change in the stance of the CQC. Acceptance of this would mean that the vast majority of individual applicants for a CEA from within any Trust in special measures would be denied the opportunity to have their application for an award assessed objectively and fairly upon the evidence of personal achievements set out in their application.
5. Professor Baker's predecessor, Professor Sir Mike Richards, did challenge one award in 2016 for a Medical Director at a Trust in special measures. Main Committee took the view that the award should be granted. This decision was based upon the fact that individual had demonstrated significant achievements over and above contractual requirements and the fact that there was no direct link between the performance of the individual and the Trust CQC rating. The application was therefore judged on merit and not on the basis of a CQC judgement on the overall performance of the Trust in which the applicant worked.

## **Recommendation**

6. We have carefully considered this issue and recommend that the awards should stand. In making this recommendation we have taken the following factors into account:
  - a. The General Medical Council has raised no concerns in relation to these consultants.
  - b. CEAs are granted following rigorous scrutiny of the evidence submitted in applications. The consultants listed at Annex A have been judged on the merits of the applications and have been successful as a result of a fair and transparent process.
  - c. Applications for CEAs are rated and signed off by Chief Executives (or their nominated Medical Director). Any concerns about the performance of individual consultants or their departments should be reflected in the application.
  - d. We have personally reviewed the applications for all of the consultants concerned and support the decisions made by regional sub-committees to recommend awards.
  - e. The CQC has not commented on individual applicants or specialties. The 'perception' of how an award will be received is not a sound basis for making decisions about CEAs.
7. It is also important to bear in mind that Barts Health NHS Trust has been in special measures since 2015 and St George's University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust since 2016. Awards were granted to consultants from those Trusts in previous awards rounds. Indeed, there will be many award holders at all three of the Trusts listed at Annex A. If no awards were to be granted in 2017, we would need to consider whether other consultants employed at these Trusts should retain their existing awards.

## **Changes to ACCEA guidance for 2018**

8. It is proposed that ACCEA guidance for employers is strengthened in 2018 to require Chief Executives (or nominated Medical Directors) to specifically highlight any concerns where consultants work in Trusts in special measures.

## **Conclusion**

9. We recommend that the consultants listed at Annex A receive awards.
10. Main Committee is asked to agree this approach.
11. A response will be sent to the CQC summarising the decision of main ACCEA, the associated reasons and the additional safeguards that will be put in place by strengthening the guidance.

# OFFICIAL – SENSITIVE

## Annex A

SPECIALTY	SURNAME	FORENAME	TYPE OF AWARD	GMC / GDC NUMBER	EMPLOYER	ROLE
Medicine	DRAKE	WILLIAM	new	3477087	BARTS HEALTH NHS TRUST	Clinical Director, Endocrinology
Medicine	MOON	JAMES	new	4216917	BARTS HEALTH NHS TRUST	Clinical Director, Cardiac Imaging
Medicine	ORKIN	CHLOE	new	4406569	BARTS HEALTH NHS TRUST	GUM, HIV medicine
Paediatrics	GRIGG	JONATHAN	new	2598620	BARTS HEALTH NHS TRUST	Paediatrician - Respiratory and Environmental Medicine
Medicine	DIZDAREVIC	SABINA	renewal	5195733	BRIGHTON AND SUSSEX UNIVERSITY HOSPITALS NHS TRUST	Nuclear Medicine /Paediatric Nuclear Medicine
Paediatrics	LAWN	CAROLYN	new	3299647	BRIGHTON AND SUSSEX UNIVERSITY HOSPITALS NHS TRUST	Neonatology
Radiology	MARCHBANK	NIGEL	renewal	3243770	BRIGHTON AND SUSSEX UNIVERSITY HOSPITALS NHS TRUST	Clinical Radiology/ Oncological Imaging
Radiology	RICHENBERG	JONATHAN	new	3497696	BRIGHTON AND SUSSEX UNIVERSITY HOSPITALS NHS TRUST	Radiologist
Surgery	ALTMAN	KEITH	new	3324392/ D 055633	BRIGHTON AND SUSSEX UNIVERSITY HOSPITALS NHS TRUST	Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery
Surgery	HYDE	JONATHAN	new	3335888	BRIGHTON AND SUSSEX UNIVERSITY HOSPITALS NHS TRUST	Cardiac Surgery/ Thoracic Surgery

Medicine	WRIGHT	JULIET	new	4108397	BRIGHTON AND SUSSEX UNIVERSITY HOSPITALS NHS TRUST	Geriatric Medicine
Paediatrics	VENUGOPALAN	POOTHIRIKOVIL	new	5089730	BRIGHTON AND SUSSEX UNIVERSITY HOSPITALS NHS TRUST	Cardiovascular Imaging / Paediatric Cardiology
Pathology	CHEVASSUT	TIMOTHY	new	4032117	BRIGHTON AND SUSSEX UNIVERSITY HOSPITALS NHS TRUST	Clinical Haematology
Surgery	YUSUF	SYED	renewal	3600238	BRIGHTON AND SUSSEX UNIVERSITY HOSPITALS NHS TRUST	Vascular Surgery
Anaesthetics	CECCONI	MAURIZIO	new	6118600	ST GEORGE'S UNIVERSITY HOSPITALS NHS FOUNDATION TRUST	Intensive Care Medicine
Medicine	PICKERING	LISA	new	4199432	ST GEORGE'S UNIVERSITY HOSPITALS NHS FOUNDATION TRUST	Medical Oncology